To Engage in Civil Practice as a Lawyer

James L. Nolan

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lawnet.fordham.edu/ulj
Part of the Religion Law Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://ir.lawnet.fordham.edu/ulj/vol26/iss4/3
TO ENGAGE IN CIVIL PRACTICE
AS A RELIGIOUS LAWYER*

James L. Nolan**

Introduction

The Lawyer’s Calling1 by Joseph G. Allegretti begins with the bold assertion that:

At its core the legal profession faces not so much a crisis of ethics, or commercialization, or public relations, but a spiritual crisis. Lawyers and their profession have lost their way.2

Any profession in crisis affects its members and those they serve. Because of the pivotal role that lawyers play in our society, a serious loss of meaning for this professional group reverberates across all levels of the community, public and private. The stakes are high. So it is important that civil law practitioners be mature, authentic individuals, capable of confronting and overcoming this crisis in meaning. For some lawyers, their religious faith serves as the motivation for dedicated, intelligent, rational and respectful practice in the law. Others fail to see any connection between religious faith and the life of a lawyer. After exploring the importance of the lawyer to society and some dimensions of the crisis identified by Allegretti, this Essay will suggest how one might more effectively bridge the gap between religious faith and legal practice to better serve clients and society.

I. The Lawyer’s Talents and Skills at the Service of Society

Lawyers have special talents and skills. Some are seen as indispensable to straightening out a society hurtling though time without an apparent compass or purpose. Mary Ann Glendon, in her

* An earlier version of this Essay was presented at the conference “Rediscovering the Role of Religion in the Lives of Lawyers and Those They Represent,” Fordham University School of Law, December 8, 1998.
2. Id. at 3.
thought-provoking book *A Nation Under Lawyers*, highlighted nine qualities, talents and skills that lawyers can bring to society. An attorney who loves goodness and seeks to do what is right will recognize in this list familiar qualities that are quite essential to the practice of law.

1. **The Eye for the Issue.** What makes a lawyer a skillful collaborator or consensus builder is more than just the clean mental slate of any intelligent onlooker. It is his practice in discerning the precise issues in controversy, whether the disagreement is about means to an end or about ends themselves.

2. **The Feel for the Common Ground.** The lawyer’s experience in delineating the issues that divide people, and in grasping just what is essential or expendable to each party in a discussion, also gives her a feel for the common ground that even determined opponents may share — and the ability to frame a settlement in terms that antagonists can accept.

3. **The Eye to the Future.** Someone still has to give inchoate understandings a concrete form that will stand the test of time . . . . A specialized, cultivated foresight often helps a lawyer supply the right words, the time-tested formula, the reliable procedural safeguards, the safe passage through stormy straits.

4. **Mastery of the Apparatus.** Mastery of the apparatus [of the law] . . . includes care for the apparatus, its history, its maintenance and proper functioning; awareness of its range of uses; and understanding its limitations.

5. **Legal Architecture.** The authors of well-crafted corporate charters and bylaws, collective bargaining agreements, leases, trusts and estate plans, . . . have extraordinary opportunities to affect for the better or worse the quality of everyday life in our large commercial republic. Theirs is the delicate job of providing structure and order while leaving as much room as possible for spontaneity and creativity.

6. **Procedure.** The history of the law, to a great extent, is the record of a search for means to enable people to order their lives together according to principles that can be understood and accepted by affected parties and onlookers — even when

---

4. *Id.* at 102-107.
5. *Id.* at 102.
6. *Id.* at 103.
7. *Id.* at 103-4.
8. *Id.* at 104.
9. *Id.* at 104-5.
the outcomes go against their interests or desires. Procedure pervades the lawyer's world.

7. **Problem Solving.** Many of the most rewarding moments of law practice occur when a lawyer devises a viable solution to a problem that has brought a client to wit's end, or when lawyers for antagonists resolve the conflict in a way that expands the pie for all concerned.10

8. **Strong tolerance.** Representing other people, in both friendly and adversarial situations, promotes in lawyers an ability to enter empathically into another person's way of seeing things while retaining a certain detachment. That cast of mind in turn fosters a sturdier form of tolerance than that produced by mere relativism or pacts of nonaggression. Strong tolerance can be attentive, protective and respectful to the other person without being "nonjudgmental."11

9. **Incremental change.** The American legal profession has provided the polity with a reliable supply of citizens especially attuned to the twin necessities of conserving hard-won achievements and imaginatively adapting old arrangements to new circumstances.12

Lawyers today have gained notoriety for using their skills in cutthroat litigation and the pursuit of wealth. Glendon’s list of skills and qualities, while seemingly commonplace, reflect a treasury of talent, which lends itself well to solving problems among individuals and groups of people, finding the peaceful resolution of disputes when they erupt and creating the infrastructure to promote greater human prosperity. These are all skills and talents needed to promote the greater good of society.

In a similar vein, Timothy W. Floyd, in his article "The Practice of Law as Vocation or Calling,"13 claims that the practice of law can be a character-building and virtue-building activity for the benefit of society as well as the individual practitioner. He asserts, "At its best lawyering does engender certain virtues and is itself sustained by those virtues."14 He names prudence, temperance, fortitude and justice as the lawyer's virtues. They sustain and are sustained by the practice of law "when done well and done right."15

As to justice, he says:

---

10. *Id.* at 106.
11. *Id.* at 106.
12. *Id.* at 107.
14. *Id.* at 1421.
15. *Id.*
This is the fundamental lawyerly virtue. A professional should have some idea or quality to profess. For our profession, that idea is preeminently justice. Ideally, the practice of law fosters and encourages justice. Conversely, the practice of law cannot long sustain itself if lawyers do not possess a thirst for justice.\textsuperscript{16}

For Floyd, society can realize the justice it craves through virtuous lawyers doing their jobs well. “And that job is representing clients. Lawyers help clients in the prevention and resolution of disputes. That is done most often through wise counseling, and through effective advocacy when necessary.”\textsuperscript{17} It is in this context of reflecting on the crucially important role lawyers play in society that the claimed loss of the lawyer’s professional bearings takes on greater concern.

\section*{II. The Lawyer’s Loss of Meaning}

Allegretti explores the causes and manifestations of this spiritual crisis in some detail. He identifies one cause as the gap between religious belief and the exigencies of daily work. He contends that lawyers might bridge this gap by affirming that the practice of law is, indeed, a vocation.\textsuperscript{18} He calls for lawyers to become healers in society and maintain a posture of service to clients with what he describes as a covenant relationship.\textsuperscript{19}

The disconnect Allegretti and others document between one’s religious faith and the experience in the workplace is hardly unique to the legal profession.\textsuperscript{20} Many people, in all walks of life, have been forced to conclude that a picture of the universe brought into being by God seems naive in the face of the harsh realities of the working world.

Research in this area buttresses Allegretti’s conclusions.\textsuperscript{21} People compartmentalize; they seal off work life from family and religious concerns. However, the research also suggests that acceptance of a world where faith and work are divorced and com-

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{16} \textit{Id.} at 1422.
\bibitem{17} \textit{Id.}
\bibitem{19} \textit{See id.}
\bibitem{20} \textit{See Allegretti, The Lawyer’s Calling, supra note 1, at 1-3; Benjamin Sells, The Soul of the Law} (1994) at 99-100, 189; \textit{Glendon, supra note 3, at 85-100.}
\end{thebibliography}
partmentalized does not come without cost. In fact, it runs counter to our deepest yearnings. People are hungry to figure out how to relate faith and work. They search for meaning and a way to bring their "deeper self" to decision-making and action.

Lawyers may find that they are particularly tested by the prevailing state of affairs. They encounter the daily struggles between the realities of law practice and the noble aspirations and desires that once prompted and now reinforce one's choice of law as a profession. Lawyers occasionally sense the weighty responsibilities assigned to the law by society. After all, it is by and through the law that deals are done, transactions occur, the community is ordered, rights are asserted, wrongs are redressed and liberties are preserved. The law, as much as anything else, is the prism through which society sees and accounts for unfolding events. Society looks to the law for answers to the issues of the day and to lawyers to design and implement corrective measures.

With the struggles arising from their practice, lawyers sometimes experience a debasement of noble desires and witness a depredation of the ideal of service and the substitution of expediency for excellence. A lawyer whose life is informed by religious faith may, by reason of that fact, find the current situation even more difficult. That need not be. Society will be better served with faithful religious lawyers in civil practice.

III. A Religious Lawyer

The organizers of the conference that prompted this Essay speak of a "religious lawyers movement." But, what is a "religious lawyer?" Who are they talking about? I find Howard Lesnick's discussion of the term most helpful. His comprehensive understanding emphasizes three constituent qualities: obligation, integration and transcendence. Often in the contemporary view of things, "religious" is taken to mean something dogmatic, oppres-

---

22. Wuthnow, supra note 21, at 55.
23. See supra note 1.
25. Howard Lesnick addresses what it means to be a religious lawyer in his article The Religious Lawyer in a Pluralist Society, 66 FORDHAM L. REV. 1469 (1998). There, he describes these three constituent qualities. See id. at 1473-91. He argues that the more authentic notion of religious obligation is one that transcends mere obedience to external command or the demands of human reason. The more authentic sense is closer to one's heartfelt response to the invitation or "the ought that beckons" that arises from a mature appreciation of God's love for us. Id. at 1477-78.
26. See id.
sive, restricting, or worse, an excuse justifying inhumane, blood-thirsty behavior, imperialism and genocide. I mean nothing of the sort. This Essay understands, a religious lawyer as a man or woman whose view of life, and all of its manifestations, is informed and nurtured by an understanding that contemplates the transcendent reality. The religious lawyer sees life as a stirring adventure, with elements of risk and hazard, yet, at the same time, grounded in a sense of security based upon transcendental benevolence. The religious lawyer seeks integration and consciously responds to an allurement that beckons beyond one's self to be the best that one can be.

Building on Allegretti's work, I maintain that the religious lawyer can and must persevere for the good of society. I suggest some ways that might serve to help those lawyers succeed, based upon an effective process that was developed in work with business executives who have joined to assist each other to integrate faith, family and profession.

IV. The Religious Lawyer's Horizon

All adults have a horizon, a world view, a Weltanschauung—an all-encompassing framework within which all their knowing occurs, all their work is done and all decisions are made. At any particular point in time, this world view is the product of an individual's social, cultural and family background, one's education, training and experience and the decisions and choices one has made over the years. While one's horizon can and does change over time, at any given moment it sets the limit for what a person can know and what he or she cares about. Put another way:

What lies beyond one's horizon is simply outside the range of one's knowledge and interests: one neither knows nor cares.

But what lies within one's horizon is in some measure, great or small, an object of interest and of knowledge.

Lawyers of whatever stripe share certain similarities in horizon due to a common educational background. For instance, lawyers gain certain intellectual and moral habits over the years from, among other things, the training and experiences that are specific to the profession. Lawyers are trained to think. Some fault this


28. BERNARD LONERGAN, METHOD IN THEOLOGY 236 (University of Toronto Press 1990).
training as too technical, as purged of humane values, as too limited and constricting.29 Others value the discipline of systematic rational thought in a time where logic, reason and concerns of the intellect seem to have taken a backseat to mindless emotionalism or post-modern nihilism.30

For most lawyers it all begins with learning “to think like a lawyer”: acquiring the lawyer's skills in identifying the relevant issues, discerning key facts and locating and employing precedent and governing authority. A lawyer's ability to render sound advice and advocate effectively and persuasively further builds upon the foregoing skills. Over time, one develops the ability to analyze situations, decide what the relevant issues are and address what needs to be done. The lawyer comes to master the craft of the law and grows in appreciation for the art of negotiating and documenting transactions, drafting briefs, writing opinions, preparing and trying cases, advising and counseling clients and mediating disputes.

I do not contend that a religious lawyer is necessarily any more skillful, energetic or effective an advocate or counselor than your average attorney. However, a religious lawyer, one whose religious faith illuminates his life, comes with a horizon that includes all these “professional” interests to which is added concern about the ultimate purpose of life, love of God and love of neighbor. Religious faith sustains each of these interests and concerns. A religious horizon grasps the deepest drive within us, propelling us towards our choices, decisions and actions.

What exactly is this added dimension for the religious lawyer? Whole traditions, theologies and religious movements have dealt with this question throughout the ages. Concern about the ultimate purpose in life is fascinating, relevant and sometimes frightening. This has been true over all of human history. Our religious traditions have not failed inquirers. The prophet Micah gives a rather pithy answer:

You have been told, Oh man, what is good, and what the Lord requires of you: only to do the right and to love goodness, and to walk humbly with your God?31

29. See Sells, supra note 20, at 47-50, 180-1.
30. See Glenendon, supra note 3, at 230-253 (providing an account of the soundness of the development of the common law based upon a profoundly sophisticated understanding of human knowing.)
31. New American Bible, Micah 6:8 (All citations to the Bible refer to the New American Bible.)
A provocative exchange between a lawyer and Jesus in Luke’s gospel adds substance to Micah’s general advice. Lawyers are rarely sympathetic characters in the New Testament. In fact, more often than not they are shown posing crafty questions, trying to trap Jesus in one way or another. One famous exchange begins with a lawyer standing up, it says, to test Jesus:

“Teacher, what must I do to inherit eternal life?” Jesus said to him, “What is written in the law? How do you read there?” He said in reply, “You shall love the Lord, your God, with all your heart, and with all your soul, and with all your strength, and with all your mind, and your neighbor as yourself.” He replied to him, “You have answered correctly; do this and you will live.”

The story continues with the lawyer pursuing the interrogation demanding a definition for the term “neighbor.” In response, Jesus told the parable of the Good Samaritan and asked the lawyer to judge which of the three passersby was a neighbor to the robbery victim. The lawyer answered, “The one who treated him with mercy.” The horizon of a religious person informed by these and similar teachings will be concerned with the love of God and neighbor, with doing what is right, with loving goodness and with walking humbly with God. A religious lawyer will have hope and confidence that giving attention to such things is not only worthwhile and necessary, but made possible because of God’s love. A religious lawyer’s horizon includes concern for promoting God’s plan for the world. In other words, such a person will want to practice law with a view of God as the ultimate client.

V. The Concrete Experience of Day-to-Day Practice

We rarely quarrel with lofty ideals. Implementation is, as ever, more difficult. Implementation in the context of the particular, the day-to-day work in the law, brings us face-to-face with concrete occasions for doing justice and loving goodness. Sometimes it is not so clear. We find ourselves in ambiguity, in the “grey area.” It is in the concrete, where we live and work, that we either succeed in doing what is truly good or fall short of the mark. We know the concrete from our own experience as tax experts, litigators, business lawyers, administrative and regulatory specialists, labor law

34. See Luke 10:30-36.
36. See Romans 5:5.
experts and family lawyers. Anyone who has practiced for a period of time knows firsthand the joys and shortcomings of the law. In search of experiences beyond my own, I conducted an informal “survey” of colleagues and friends, somewhat less than a fully “scientific effort.” All respondents were engaged in corporate practice at large firms. They were young and old, male and female. They were asked two questions: (1) what are five satisfying, exciting, wonderful things you can say about your practice and (2) what five things do you find most troubling or discouraging about your practice.

In response to the first question concerning the positive attributes of practicing law, respondents listed:

1. Intellectual stimulation. This notion was primarily expressed in terms of the ability to think about challenging issues, solve problems and encounter exciting new cases, events, situations and personalities.
2. Working with others who were smart, able and effective professionals.
3. Being able to help people.
4. The excitement of competition.
5. Financial comfort.
6. Respect.37

The negative responses were fairly consistent:

1. Family pressure. Respondents saw pressures being imposed upon them by their profession that hurt their family life and jeopardized their relationships and responsibilities outside of work. This negative was most tellingly illustrated by a brilliant senior associate’s fear that starting a family might derail her promising career.
2. Time pressure: “Making life fit in between professional performances.” Respondents spoke of the tyranny of billable hours and compensation systems that can affect and sometimes skew judgement.
3. The devaluing of honesty and integrity in the profession. A frequent complaint was that lawyers tend to overstate, lie, back off of agreements, negotiate in bad faith and, perhaps even more troubling, actually seem to get away with it.
4. Moral deviance. This conflict was illustrated by situations where the position the lawyer was required to assert for the client was legally correct, but nevertheless inequitable and morally indefensible.

37. One woman reported that her practice gave her a degree of immediate acceptance, legitimacy, and respect that would be more difficult to find in any other calling.
5. Litigation centers around conflict. Almost universally, the respondents, including litigators, complained about the harm caused by the litigation system. Someone always walks away the loser and, all too often, both parties to a conflict end up losing. Litigation is seen as destructive of the parties, the system and even the advocates, while, at the same time, it is highly remunerative for the lawyers and the firm.

If this informal survey is any gauge, a lawyer in civil practice will conclude that while the practice of law can be wonderfully thrilling and rewarding, it comes at a price. The profession offers lawyers ample opportunity to fall short of their ultimate goals in life. Lawyers are free, and sometimes encouraged, to choose something other than goodness. In light of the pressures, costs and compromises seen in concrete experience, how is a religious lawyer, someone who loves goodness and seeks to do the right thing, to persevere and thrive?

VI. What is a Religious Lawyer to do?

I speak from a Christian perspective, but I do not believe that what I propose is really very different from what other faith perspectives suggest. The following are what I believe are the necessary components the religious lawyer must promote.

1. Engagement. The good that lawyers can do for individuals and society is far too important to ignore. All are called to collaborate in God's creative and redemptive work and use our skills and talents for the greater good.39 The implication of that call for a reli-

38. The reader may find it instructive to explore these questions with reference to his or her own practice. Take a few minutes to list five exhilarating, life-giving qualities you find in the practice and five negative, deadening, or troubling things. Are the results similar to those noted? Do they raise new questions, point to new directions?

39. This may seem self-evident, but the religious traditions have highlighted this fact in recent years. For example, Pope John Paul II frequently writes and speaks of collaboration with God. His observations to managers and professionals in Durango, Mexico are fairly typical of much of what he has said over the years:

We must contemplate human activity in the light of the collaboration with God that every human being is called to offer. Our world today . . . must also become an echo of this divine design and collaborate with the Creator in the transformation of the world according to God's plan.

Pope John Paul II, Address Before Members of the Business Community in Durango, Mexico (May 9, 1990), in ROBERT G. KENNEDY, DIGNITY OF WORK: JOHN PAUL II SPEAKS TO MANAGERS AND WORKERS 65 (1994). Kennedy defines John Paul II's frequent use of the term "Collaboration with God" to convey the notion that: "Human work expresses a sharing in the divine work of creation. By putting to use the wealth of spiritual and material resources given them by the Creator, human persons contribute to the progress of society and their own sanctification." Id. at 355.
gious lawyer is neither to withdraw from society nor to construct compartments to wall off concerns generated by religious sensibilities. Envisioning one's profession as a vocation is one way to assume the attitude, disposition and commitment necessary to answer the call. The task at hand is to bring one's whole self (mind, heart and soul) to each day's challenges and opportunities for the service of the client's needs and the systems that promote justice and order in society. Society's overall investment in the procedures and institutions of the law, as well as in the skills and talents of its professionals, is far too great to suggest any course for a religious lawyer other than engagement.

2. Community. In our very secular culture, being a person who can accept and proclaim that religious faith informs one's life can be quite lonely. A lawyer seeking more than the skillful compartmentalization or suppression of religious sensibilities requires a community of support and encouragement. Our faith communities — going back in time, embedded in the present and facing the future — can help to channel and encourage our desire to do what is right and love of goodness. There is evil and sin in the world. We sin; we fall short. There are systems and structures in our society that promote evil as well as those that support goodness and justice. Alone, we have a tendency to overlook the absurdity of evil and sin. Alone, we lack the power to confront the structures or systems that encourage evil. Within a faith community, however, one is spurred to recognize what one might otherwise overlook and to question what would otherwise remain buried in ignorance. We can find support and encouragement with others in the pursuit of goodness. In collaboration we can design and implement practices and systems that foster justice and free people to do what is right.

3. Prayer We are not alone. In fact, we are loved by God into being and empowered in life by God's grace. By prayer we keep our communication lines with God open and supple. While no particular form or method can be said to be tailored for the lawyer, a lawyer's training and verbal bent might make praying with the Psalms a particularly compatible communication pathway. Moreover, we need to probe our own religious traditions to better know God, God's works and God's will for us. Our religious traditions

40. See Allegretti, *The Lawyer's Calling*, supra note 1, at 13, 16.
recognize that study can be a very positive form of prayer. The same diligence and energy spent in learning the facts and the law relevant to a particular matter can, when focused on the history, practices and grounding of one’s religious tradition, produce rare and enriching fruit.

VII. A Process that Fosters Prayer and Community

The Woodstock Business Conference\textsuperscript{43} set out to help business leaders of faith find the necessary language and encouragement to create and maintain business cultures consistent with Judeo-Christian values. To do this, it initiated a national network of business executives who meet in local chapters to offer each other a kind of peer ministry in support of the mission. Over the course of six years, a meeting process developed. This process has been credited with the success the Conference has enjoyed. This process embodies a manner of proceeding that is perfectly attuned to the lawyer’s way. The real issues arising from the concrete experience of group members are surfaced and addressed in a manner that produces small steps and incremental changes that, over time, make a significant difference for goodness and the reinforcement of right.

The process,\textsuperscript{44} as practiced by Woodstock groups in fourteen cities, takes the form of monthly meetings that run about one and a half hours. The meetings are held at the same time and place each month and aim to begin and end on time so that busy executives can count on and set aside the time on their calendars. The meeting format includes certain elements, such as: introductions, opening prayer, a reminder of the mission of the group, Scripture reading followed by a period of silence and a sharing of insights on the passage, discussion of the topic for the meeting led by one of the group, reflection and evaluation of the meeting and closing prayer.

Woodstock Business Conference members affirm that they have grown morally and ethically. They say that they can better see the good and evil in their work lives and elsewhere. They sense that they are empowered to choose and act more responsibly. They call the WBC chapter meetings their examination of conscience or “monthly moral checkup.” They report that they have become


“better spiritual leaders back at work.” They speak of new insights, sharpened perceptions and fresh frameworks for understanding the problems they confront. They find the necessary encouragement to take innovative and effective action and to initiate needed change.

**Conclusion**

A religious lawyer, one who carries a sense of obligation, a desire for integration and a drive for the transcendent is called by his or her religious tradition and community to a way of being — living and professing the same values and behaviors at home as in the office or the courthouse. Our religious traditions challenge our notions and behaviors by promoting prayerful reflection and disciplined lives. A religious horizon empowers us to recognize important questions as our actions affect the lives of those we encounter and the profession itself. We must engage in the practice of law intelligently, reasonably, responsibly and lovingly. Alone, it is hard do this well. We are sustained when we are conscious of our relationship with our God and our neighbor and work to build society accordingly.

---

45. *Id.* at 19.
46. See *id.* at 20.