Fordham Law School

FLASH: The Fordham Law Archive of Scholarship and History

All Decisions

Housing Court Decisions Project

2022-10-19

Harlem 133 Owner, LLC v. Jimenez

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lawnet.fordham.edu/housing_court_all

Recommended Citation

"Harlem 133 Owner, LLC v. Jimenez" (2022). *All Decisions*. 665. https://ir.lawnet.fordham.edu/housing_court_all/665

This Housing Court Decision is brought to you for free and open access by the Housing Court Decisions Project at FLASH: The Fordham Law Archive of Scholarship and History. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Decisions by an authorized administrator of FLASH: The Fordham Law Archive of Scholarship and History. For more information, please contact tmelnick@law.fordham.edu.

Harlem 133 Owner, LLC v Jimenez

2022 NY Slip Op 33591(U)

October 19, 2022

Supreme Court, New York County

Docket Number: Index No. 152456/2022

Judge: Andrea Masley

Cases posted with a "30000" identifier, i.e., 2013 NY Slip Op 30001(U), are republished from various New York State and local government sources, including the New York State Unified Court System's eCourts Service.

This opinion is uncorrected and not selected for official publication.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 162

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/19/2022

INDEX NO. 152456/2022

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YOR COUNTY OF NEW YORK: COMMERCIAL DIVISION.	ON PART 48	
HARLEM 133 OWNER, LLC F/K/A HARLEM 133 LENDER, LLC,	INDEX NO.	152456/2022
Plaintiff,	MOTION DATE	N/A
- V -	MOTION SEQ. NO.	002
ROSA JIMENEZ, LOURDES AQUINO, MEDELINE BURDIER, BLANCA MOLINUEVO, KEVIN SCOTT, KATRINA WILEY, MARIO FLORES, ALBAR IRIS FLORES, DEBBIE LIMA, AMANDA DEVALLE, YVONNE GARCIA, JOCLYN GARCIA, REEM MARBROUK, GISELLE PENA, YARLIN PENA, JENNIFER AVILA, KARINA MARTINEZ, CRISTO REYES, OLIVIA JOHNSON, GABRIEL JAMES, JAZZMIN ROSARIA, ABDULLAH RASHID, SHARNASIA VANCE, GEORGETTE HYMAN, GREGORY GADSEN, SHAKIA JOHNSON, DWAYNE SEIFFORTH, PAULETTE CRAWFORD, WISMIDE LOUIS, TONIA VAIL, TYSHEFF BROWN, JAZMINE GUZMAN, JARILZA CORUJO, SONYA JAMES, EPPY DAVIS, and JOHN AND JANE DOES 1-26,	DECISION + C	
HON. ANDREA MASLEY:		
The following e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF document in were read on this motion to/for VACATE - DECISION VACATE -	number (Motion 002) 156 ON/ORDER/JUDGMEN	
Upon the foregoing documents, it is		
Defendant Karina Martinez moves by order to	show ¹ to vacate the	default
judgment against her, which was entered on Septem	ber 28, 2022 (NYSC	EF Doc No.
[NYSCEF] 149, Decision and Order.)		

Page 1 of 4

Motion No. 002

¹ Defendants' objection to Martinez's motion by OSC, authorized by CPLR 2211, instead of by notice of motion pursuant to CPLR 2214(a) or (b), is wrong as a matter of law since an OSC is a "substitute for motion." (Siegel, NY Prac. § 248 at 478 [6th ed 2018].) An order to show cause is entirely appropriate in light of Ms. Martinez's imminent eviction; she need not wait until the sheriff is at her door.

152456/2022 HARLEM 133 OWNER, LLC F/K/A HARLEM 133 LENDER, LLC vs. JIMENEZ, ROSA

ET AL

NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 10/19/2022 04:49

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 162

INDEX NO. 152456/2022 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/19/2022

Under CPLR 5015, a party seeking to vacate a default judgment must demonstrate both a reasonable excuse for the default and a meritorious defense to the action. (See e.g., Eugene Di Lorenzo, Inc. v AC Dutton Lumber Co., Inc., 67 NY2d 138, 141 [1986].) For the reasons stated on the record on October 17, 2022, the motion is denied. This court's September 28, 2022 Order and Judgment is stayed for 30 days, until November 15, 2022, to give Ms. Martinez and her two sons time to find a new home, after which plaintiff may proceed with the eviction.

This is an ejectment action commenced by plaintiff, Harlem 133 Owner, LLC, the owner of the real property located at 308-310 West 133rd Street, New York, New York 10030 (Property). (NYSCEF 2, Complaint ¶1.)

On March 18, 2019, plaintiff made a loan to W133 Owner, LLC (Borrower) in the amount of \$26,000,000 (Loan). (Id. ¶35.) The loan was guaranteed by Borrower's principal Levi Balkany. (Id. ¶44.) The Loan was contingent on Borrower's representation that the Property is only permitted to be "used exclusively as a residential Condominium property." (Id. ¶37; NYSCEF 3, Loan Agreement, § 4.1.20.) Borrower agreed it "may not enter into any Lease . . . without the prior written consent of Lender." (NYSCEF 2, Complaint ¶39; NYSCEF 3, Loan Agreement § 5.1.17[a].) Borrower defaulted under the Loan Documents for leasing in violation of the Loan Documents, and in violation of N.Y.C. Admin. Code §27-2097 (barring unregistered rental establishments). (NYSCEF 2, Complaint ¶40.)

On June 5, 2020, Lender commenced an action against Borrower and codefendant guarantor Balkany in this court, captioned Harlem 133 Lender, LLC v W133 Owner, LLC, et al., Index No. 652300/2020 (State Court Action), asserting three causes

152456/2022 HARLEM 133 OWNER, LLC F/K/A HARLEM 133 LENDER, LLC vs. JIMENEZ, ROSA Page 2 of 4 **ET AL** Motion No. 002

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 162

INDEX NO. 152456/2022

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/19/2022

of action: (1) breach of contract; (2) injunctive relief enjoining and restraining Borrower and Balkany from continuing leasing and directing Borrower and Balkany to advise interested parties that any lease purportedly executed in violation of the Loan Documents is void; and (3) appointing a receiver. (NYSCEF 2, Complaint ¶44.) On June 16, 2020, the court enjoined the Borrower, Balkany, or anyone else from "transferring, leasing, using, misusing, or otherwise encumbering the Property." (NYSCEF 5, June 16, 2020 Order to Show Cause.) Borrower and Balkany admitted to leasing Property units without Lender's permission, thereby breaching the terms of the Loan Documents. (NYSCEF 6, July 13, 2020 Decision and Order at 1.)

The Borrower filed for bankruptcy in the EDNY on July 16, 2020. (NYSCEF 2, Complaint ¶49 [In re W133 Owner LLC, Case No. 20-42637-nhl].) The Bankruptcy Court rejected the unexpired leases. (Id. ¶54; NYSCEF 8, Findings of Fact.)

Plaintiff initiated this action on March 23, 2022 against 35 unknowing tenants who leased the premises from Borrower and Balkany with the assistance of New York City agencies.² (NYSCEF 1 and 2, Summons and Complaint.) On March 29, 2022, plaintiff's process server, personally served the complaint, upon Ms. Martinez, pursuant to CPLR 320(a), requiring an answer or appearance by April 18, 2022. (NYSCEF 20, Affidavit of Service.)

In an October 8, 2022 affidavit, Christine Perez, Ms. Martinez's sister, states that she mailed the answer on May 10, 2022 to Meisel, plaintiff's attorney in this action as

Page 3 of 4

² The court was informed at arguments on September 26, 2022 and October 18, 2022 by attorneys for some of the tenants that HRA and DSS worked with Balkany and the tenants to arrange occupancy.

^{152456/2022} HARLEM 133 OWNER, LLC F/K/A HARLEM 133 LENDER, LLC vs. JIMENEZ, ROSA **ET AL**

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 162

INDEX NO. 152456/2022 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/19/2022

directed by the Summons. (NYSCEF 156, Perez Affidavit at 8/9.3) Meisel denies receipt of Ms. Martinez's answer. (NYSCEF 47, Meisel Aff ¶12.) In addition to being late, to date, the answer has not been provided to the court. Ms. Martinez has not provided the court with a reasonable excuse.

Plaintiff served Ms. Martinez with the default motion on June 3, 2022. (NYSCEF 60, Affidavit of Service.) Ms. Martinez failed to oppose the motion or contact the court or appear for the argument on September 26, 2022. Ms. Martinez has not provided any explanation for failing to respond to the default motion.

Ms. Martinez also has no meritorious defense. She has no right to occupy the condominium unit because (a) she unknowingly entered into occupancy in violation of this Court's TRO; (b) any purported lease which she entered into was invalid and void; and (c) even if the lease was valid at some point, it was rejected by the Bankruptcy Court. (NYSCEF 8, ¶9.)

Accordingly, it is

ORDERED that the TRO is vacated; and it is further

ORDERED that the motion to vacate the default is denied; and it is further

ORDERED that this court's September 28, 2022 Order and Judgment (NYSCEF

161) is stayed as to Karina Martinez until November 15, 2022.

		DZZ1549A32438AMASLEYAF8D786783ZE416EEFA5Z93AAE5D6E38
10/19/2022 DATE	-	ANDREA MASLEY, J.S.C.
CHECK ONE:	CASE DISPOSED GRANTED X DENIED	X NON-FINAL DISPOSITION GRANTED IN PART OTHER
APPLICATION: CHECK IF APPROPRIATE:	SETTLE ORDER INCLUDES TRANSFER/REASSIGN	SUBMIT ORDER FIDUCIARY APPOINTMENT REFERENCE

Page 4 of 4

Motion No. 002

³ NYSCEF pagination.

^{152456/2022} HARLEM 133 OWNER, LLC F/K/A HARLEM 133 LENDER, LLC vs. JIMENEZ, ROSA ET AL